

PLURAL LOGIC (vdBerg 1994, 1995)

1. TWO APPROACHES TO PLURAL NPS

• Paradigm examples

- | | |
|---|----------------------|
| (1) Adam and Beth <i>lifted (a stack of) three crates (together).</i> | collective VP |
| (2) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (the same stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, wide obj |
| (3) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (a different stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, narrow obj |

• Plural entity approach (Sharvy 1980, Link 1987)

- | | |
|---|--|
| (1) Adam and Beth <i>lifted (a stack of) three crates (together).</i> | collective VP |
| (1 _L) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge {}^D\lambda y [C(y)](y) \wedge L(x, y)))$ | |
| x | y |
| {a, b} | {c ₁ , c ₂ , c ₃ } |
| (2) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (the same stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, wide obj |
| (2 _L) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge {}^D\lambda y' [C(y)](y) \wedge {}^D\lambda x' [L(x', y)](x)))$ | |
| x | y |
| {a} | {c ₁ , c ₂ , c ₃ } |
| {b} | {c ₁ , c ₂ , c ₃ } |
| (3) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (a different stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, narrow obj |
| (3 _L) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge {}^D\lambda x' [\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge {}^D\lambda y' [C(y)](y) \wedge L(x', y)](x)))$ | |
| x | y |
| {a} | {c ₁ , c ₂ , c ₃ } |
| {b} | {c ₁ ', c ₂ ', c ₃ '} |

• Plural info-state approach (vdBerg 1994, 1995)

- | | |
|--|----------------------|
| (1) Adam and Beth <i>lifted (a stack of) three crates (together).</i> | collective VP |
| (1 _B) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y)))$ | |
| x | y |
| a | c ₁ |
| a | c ₂ |
| b | c ₃ |
| (2) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (the same stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, wide obj |
| (2 _B) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y))))$ | |
| x | y |
| a | c ₁ |
| a | c ₂ |
| a | c ₃ |
| b | c ₁ |
| b | c ₂ |
| b | c ₃ |
| (3) Adam and Beth <i>(each) lifted (a different stack of) three crates.</i> | dist. VP, narrow obj |
| (3 _B) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))))$ | |

2 LOGIC WITH PLURALITIES (LP, see Link 1983, 1987)

DEFINITION 1 (LP-syntax)

- i. $A \in \mathbf{Trm}$ if $A \in \mathbf{Con}$ or $A \in \mathbf{Var}$
- ii. $(A \oplus B) \in \mathbf{Trm}$ if $A, B \in \mathbf{Trm}$ (Link 1987:152)
- iii. $\mathbf{n}(A) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $A \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- iv. $B(A_1, \dots, A_n) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $B \in \mathbf{Prd}^n$ and $A_1, \dots, A_n \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- v. $(A \leq B) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $A, B \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- vi. $\neg\phi \in \mathbf{For}$ if $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$
- vii. $(\phi \wedge \psi) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $\phi, \psi \in \mathbf{For}$
- viii. $\exists u\phi \in \mathbf{For}$ if $u \in \mathbf{Var}$ and $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$

DEFINITION 2 (LP-models and assignments)

M. A LP-model is a structure $M = \langle D, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket \rangle$ such that:

- i. $D = \mathcal{P}(\mathbf{A}) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$, for some non-empty set \mathbf{A} (of proto-atoms)
- ii. For any $A \in \mathbf{Con}$, $\llbracket A \rrbracket \in D$, and for any $B \in \mathbf{Prd}^n$, $\llbracket B \rrbracket \subseteq D^n$.
- g.** An M -assignment is a function g such that $\text{Dom } g = \mathbf{Var}$ and $\text{Ran } g \subseteq D$.
The set of M -assignments is denoted by \mathcal{G}^M . For any $g, h \in \mathcal{G}^M$, $u \in \mathbf{Var}$, $d \in D$,
 $g[u/d] := (g \setminus \{\langle u, g(u) \rangle\}) \cup \{\langle u, d \rangle\}$
 $g \approx_u h$ iff $\exists d \in D: g[u/d] = h$

DEFINITION 3 (LP-semantic)

- i. $g \llbracket A \rrbracket = \llbracket A \rrbracket$ if $A \in \mathbf{Con}$
 $= g(A)$ if $A \in \mathbf{Var}$
- ii. $g \llbracket (A \oplus B) \rrbracket = (g \llbracket A \rrbracket \cup g \llbracket B \rrbracket)$
- iii. $g \llbracket \mathbf{n}(A) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $|g \llbracket A \rrbracket| = n$
- iv. $g \llbracket B(A_1 \dots A_n) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $\langle g \llbracket A_1 \rrbracket, \dots, g \llbracket A_n \rrbracket \rangle \in \llbracket B \rrbracket$
- v. $g \llbracket (A \leq B) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $g \llbracket A \rrbracket \subseteq g \llbracket B \rrbracket$
- vi. $g \llbracket \neg\phi \rrbracket = \top$ iff $g \llbracket \phi \rrbracket \neq \top$
- vii. $g \llbracket (\phi \wedge \psi) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $g \llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$ & $g \llbracket \psi \rrbracket = \top$
- viii. $g \llbracket \exists u\phi \rrbracket = \top$ iff $\exists h: g \approx_u h$ & $h \llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$

DEFINITION 4 (LP truth).

ϕ is true in M , written $\models_M \phi$, iff $\forall g \in \mathcal{G}^M: g \llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$

ABBREVIATIONS

- $(A = B) := ((A \leq B) \wedge (B \leq A))$
- $(\phi \rightarrow \psi) := \neg(\phi \wedge \neg\psi)$
- $\forall u\phi := \neg\exists u\neg\phi$
- ${}^D\lambda u[\phi](A) := \forall v(v \leq A \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])$ $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$, no v in ϕ , $A \in \mathbf{Trm}$
where $\phi[u/v]$ is obtained from ϕ by replacing every occurrence of u with v

3 PLURAL LOGIC (PIL, see vdBerg 1994, 1995)

DEFINITION 1 (PIL-syntax)

- i. $A \in \mathbf{Trm}$ if $A \in \mathbf{Con}$ or $A \in \mathbf{Var}$
- ii. $(A \oplus B) \in \mathbf{Trm}$ if $A, B \in \mathbf{Trm}$ (Link 1987:152)
- iii. $\mathbf{n}(A) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $A \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- iv. $B(A_1, \dots, A_n) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $B \in \mathbf{Prd}^n$ and $A_1, \dots, A_n \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- v. $(A \subseteq B) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $A, B \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- vi. $\neg\phi \in \mathbf{For}$ if $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$
- vii. $(\phi \wedge \psi) \in \mathbf{For}$ if $\phi, \psi \in \mathbf{For}$
- viii. $\exists u\phi \in \mathbf{For}$ if $u \in \mathbf{Var}$ and $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$

DEFINITION 2 (PIL-models and assignments)

M. A PIL-model is a structure $M = \langle D, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket \rangle$ such that:

- i. D is a non-empty set (of entities)
- ii. For any $A \in \mathbf{Con}$, $\llbracket A \rrbracket \in D$, and for any $B \in \mathbf{Prd}^n$, $\llbracket B \rrbracket \subseteq (\mathcal{P}(D))^n$.
- g.** An M -assignment is a function g such that $\text{Dom } g = \mathbf{Var}$ and $\text{Ran } g \subseteq D$.
The set of M -assignments is denoted by \mathcal{G}^M . For any $g \in \mathcal{G}^M$, $u \in \mathbf{Var}$, $d \in D$,
 $g[u/d] := (g \setminus \{\langle u, g(u) \rangle\}) \cup \{\langle u, d \rangle\}$
- G.** An M -info state is a set of M -assignments. For any $G, H \subseteq \mathcal{G}^M$, $u \in \mathbf{Var}$, $d \in D$,
 $G(u) := \{g(u) : g \in G\}$ vdB 95:§3.2
 $G[u/d] := \{g[u/d] : g \in G\}$ vdB 95:§3.2
 $G \approx_u H$ iff $\forall d: G[u/d] = H[u/d]$ vdB 95:§3.2

DEFINITION 3 (PIL-semantic)

- i. $G\llbracket A \rrbracket = \{\llbracket A \rrbracket\}$ if $A \in \mathbf{Con}$ MB
 $= G(A)$ if $A \in \mathbf{Var}$ vdB 95:§3.2
- ii. $G\llbracket (A \oplus B) \rrbracket = (G\llbracket A \rrbracket \cup G\llbracket B \rrbracket)$ Link 1987:152
- iii. $G\llbracket \mathbf{n}(A) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $|G\llbracket A \rrbracket| = n$ cf. vdB 94:0, **sing**
- iv. $G\llbracket B(A_1 \dots A_n) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $\langle G\llbracket A_1 \rrbracket, \dots, G\llbracket A_n \rrbracket \rangle \in \llbracket B \rrbracket$ vdB 94:§2
- v. $G\llbracket (A \subseteq B) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $G\llbracket A \rrbracket \subseteq G\llbracket B \rrbracket$ vdB 94:§2
- vi. $G\llbracket \neg\phi \rrbracket = \top$ iff $G\llbracket \phi \rrbracket \neq \top$ vdB 94:§2
- vii. $G\llbracket (\phi \wedge \psi) \rrbracket = \top$ iff $G\llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$ & $G\llbracket \psi \rrbracket = \top$ vdB 94:§2
- viii. $G\llbracket \exists u\phi \rrbracket = \top$ iff $\exists H: G \approx_u H$ & $H\llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$ vdB 95:§3.2

DEFINITION 4 (PIL-truth).

ϕ is *true* in M , written $\models_M \phi$, iff $\mathcal{G}^M\llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$

ABBREVIATIONS

- $(A = B) := ((A \subseteq B) \wedge (B \subseteq A))$
- $(\phi \rightarrow \psi) := \neg(\phi \wedge \neg\psi)$
- $\forall u\phi := \neg\exists u\neg\phi$
- $\delta_u(\phi) := \forall v(v \subseteq u \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])$ $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$, no v in ϕ
where $\phi[u/v]$ is obtained from ϕ by replacing every occurrence of u with v

4 SOME USEFUL FACTS

LP facts:

$$F= \quad g[(A = B)] = \top, \text{ iff } g[A] = g[B]$$

$$F\rightarrow \quad g[(\phi \rightarrow \psi)] \neq \top, \text{ iff } g[\phi] = \top \ \& \ g[\psi] \neq \top$$

$$F\forall \quad g[\forall u\phi] = \top, \text{ iff } \underline{\hspace{15em}}$$

$$F^D \quad g[{}^D\lambda u[\phi](A)] = \top, \text{ iff } \underline{\hspace{15em}}$$

Sample proofs:

F \forall

1. $g[\forall u\phi] = \top$

2. $g[\neg\exists u\neg\phi] = \top$

3. $g[\exists u\neg\phi] \neq \top$

4. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_u h \ \& \ h[\neg\phi] = \top)$

5. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_u h \ \& \ h[\phi] \neq \top)$

6. $\forall h(g \approx_u h \rightarrow h[\phi] \neq \top)$

df. \forall D3: \neg D3: \exists D3: \neg

rearrange

F δ

1. $g[{}^D\lambda u[\phi](A)] = \top$

:

PIL facts:

$$F= \quad G[(A = B)] = \top, \text{ iff } G[A] = G[B]$$

$$F\rightarrow \quad G[(\phi \rightarrow \psi)] \neq \top, \text{ iff } G[\phi] = \top \ \& \ G[\psi] \neq \top$$

$$F\forall \quad G[\forall u\phi] = \top, \text{ iff } \underline{\hspace{15em}}$$

$$F\delta \quad G[\delta_u(\phi)] = \top, \text{ iff } \underline{\hspace{15em}}$$

Sample proofs:

F \forall

1. $G[\forall u\phi] = \top$

:

F δ

1. $G[\delta_u(\phi)] = \top$

:

APPENDIX: SOME USEFUL FACTS

LP facts:

$$F\forall \quad g[\forall u\phi] = \top, \text{ iff } \forall h(g \approx_u h \rightarrow h[\phi] = \top)$$

$$F^D \quad g[\lambda^D \phi(A)] = \top, \text{ iff } \forall h(g \approx_v h \& h(v) \subseteq h[A] \& |h(v)|=1 \rightarrow h[\phi[u/v]] = \top)$$

Proof of $F\forall$

1. $g[\forall u\phi] = \top$
 2. $g[\neg\exists u\neg\phi] = \top$ df. \forall
 3. $g[\exists u\neg\phi] \neq \top$ D3: \neg
 4. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_u h \& h[\neg\phi] = \top)$ D3: \exists
 5. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_u h \& h[\phi] \neq \top)$ D3: \neg
 6. $\forall h(g \approx_u h \rightarrow h[\phi] = \top)$ rearr.
-

Proof of F^D

1. $g[\lambda^D \phi(A)] = \top$
 2. $g[\forall v(v \subseteq A \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] = \top$ df. D
 3. $\forall h(g \approx_v h \rightarrow h[(v \subseteq A \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] = \top)$ F \forall
 4. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_v h \& h[(v \subseteq A \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] \neq \top)$ rearr.
 5. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_v h \& h[(v \subseteq A \wedge \mathbf{1}(v))] = \top \& h[\phi[u/v]] \neq \top)$ F \rightarrow
 6. $\neg\exists h(g \approx_v h \& h(v) \subseteq h[A] \& |h(v)|=1 \& h[\phi[u/v]] \neq \top)$ D3: $\subseteq, \mathbf{1}, A$
 7. $\forall h(g \approx_v h \& h(v) \subseteq h[A] \& |h(v)|=1 \rightarrow h[\phi[u/v]] = \top)$ rearr.
-

PIL facts:

$$F\forall \quad G[\forall u\phi] = \top, \text{ iff } \forall H(G \approx_u H \rightarrow H[\phi] = \top)$$

$$F\delta \quad G[\delta_u(\phi)] = \top, \text{ iff } \forall H(G \approx_v H \& H(v) \subseteq H(u) \& |H(v)|=1 \rightarrow H[\phi[u/v]] = \top)$$

Proof of $F\forall$

1. $G[\forall u\phi] = \top$
 2. $G[\neg\exists u\neg\phi] = \top$ df. \forall
 3. $G[\exists u\neg\phi] \neq \top$ D3: \neg
 4. $\neg\exists H(G \approx_u H \& H[\neg\phi] = \top)$ D3: \exists
 5. $\neg\exists H(G \approx_u H \& H[\phi] \neq \top)$ D3: \neg
 6. $\forall H(G \approx_u H \rightarrow H[\phi] = \top)$ rearr.
-

Proof of $F\delta$

1. $G[\delta_u(\phi)] = \top$
 2. $G[\forall v(v \subseteq u \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] = \top$ df. δ
 3. $\forall H(G \approx_v H \rightarrow H[(v \subseteq u \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] = \top)$ F \forall
 4. $\neg\exists H(G \approx_v H \& H[(v \subseteq u \wedge \mathbf{1}(v) \rightarrow \phi[u/v])] \neq \top)$ rearr.
 5. $\neg\exists H(G \approx_v H \& H[(v \subseteq u \wedge \mathbf{1}(v))] = \top \& H[\phi[u/v]] \neq \top)$ F \rightarrow
 6. $\neg\exists H(G \approx_v H \& H(v) \subseteq H(u) \& |H(v)|=1 \& H[\phi[u/v]] \neq \top)$ D3: $\subseteq, \mathbf{1}, A$
 7. $\forall H(G \approx_v H \& H(v) \subseteq H(u) \& |H(v)|=1 \rightarrow H[\phi[u/v]] = \top)$ rearr.
-

COLLECTIVITY & DISTRIBUTIVITY IN PIL

1. COLLECTIVE VP

(1) Adam and Beth *lifted (a stack of) three crates (together)*.

1. $\models_M \exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y)))$
2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y)))] = \top$ D4: \models
3. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H[\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y)))] = \top$ D3: \exists
4. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H$ D3: $\wedge, \text{F}=\, \text{D3:}\oplus, A$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\} \cup \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}$
 $\ \& \ H[\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))] = \top$
5. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H$ df. $\cup, \text{D3:}\exists, \wedge$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$
 $\ \& \ \exists J(H \approx_y J \ \& \ J[\mathbf{3}(y)] = \top \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ J[L(x, y)] = \top)$
6. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ rearr.
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J[\mathbf{3}(y)] = \top$
 $\ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ J[L(x, y)] = \top$
7. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D3: $n, \text{F}\delta, \text{D3:}B(\$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(y) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K[C(z)] = \top)$
 $\ \& \ \langle J(x), J(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$
8. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D3: $B(\langle a \rangle = a$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(y) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle J(x), J(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$
9. $\exists H, J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D2: $\approx_u, G(u)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$
10. $\exists H, J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ simplify
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$

e.g. $J: \begin{array}{cc} x & y \\ a & c_1 \\ a & c_2 \\ b & c_3 \end{array}$ partial matrix for one witness for J ,
leaving out irrelevant variables & other assignments (i.e. rows)
with other values for irrelevant variables

11. $\exists c_1, c_2, c_3:$ simplify
 $|\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3 \ \& \ \{\{c_1\}, \{c_2\}, \{c_3\}\} \subseteq \llbracket C \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$

2. DISTRIBUTIVE VP WITH WIDE SCOPE OBJECT

- (2) Adam and Beth (each) *lifted (the same stack of) three crates.* dist. VP, wide obj
- (2_B) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y))))$
1. $\models_M \exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y))))$
 2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y))))] = \top$ D4: \models
 3. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H[(x = a \oplus b \wedge \exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y))))] = \top$ D3: \exists
 4. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H$ D3: $\wedge, \text{F=}, \text{D3: } \oplus, A$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\} \cup \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}$
 $\ \& \ H[\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge \delta_x(L(x, y)))] = \top$
 5. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H$ df. $\cup, \text{D3: } \exists, \wedge$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$
 $\ \& \ \exists J(H \approx_y J \ \& \ J[\mathbf{3}(y)] = \top \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ J[\delta_x(L(x, y))] = \top)$
 6. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ rearrange
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J[\mathbf{3}(y)] = \top$
 $\ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ J[\delta_x(L(x, y))] = \top$
 7. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D3: $n, \text{F}\delta, \text{D3: } B(\dots)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(y) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K[C(z)] = \top)$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(x) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K[L(z, y)] = \top)$
 8. $\exists H, J: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D3: $B(\langle a \rangle = a)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(y) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(x) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow \langle K(z), K(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 9. $\exists H, J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ D2: $\approx_u, G(u)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow \langle K(z), \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 10. $\exists H, J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_y J$ simplify
 $\ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$
- e.g. $J: \begin{array}{cc} x & y \\ a & c_1 \\ a & c_2 \\ a & c_3 \\ b & c_1 \\ b & c_2 \\ b & c_3 \end{array}$ partial matrix, relevant variables & assignments only
11. $\exists c_1, c_2, c_3:$ simplify
 $\ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3 \ \& \ \{\{c_1\}, \{c_2\}, \{c_3\}\} \subseteq \llbracket C \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket$

3. DISTRIBUTIVE VP WITH NARROW SCOPE OBJECT

- (3) Adam and Beth (each) *lifted (a different stack of) three crates.* dist. VP, narrow obj
 (3_B) $\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))))$
1. $\models_M \exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))))$
 2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))))] = \top$ D4:|=
 3. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H[\exists x(x = a \oplus b \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y))))] = \top$ D3:∃
 4. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\} \cup \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D3:∧, F=, D3:⊕, A
 $\ \& \ H[\delta_x(\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(x, y)))] = \top$
 5. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ df. ∪, Fδ
 $\ \& \ \forall K(H \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq K(x) \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1$
 $\ \rightarrow K[\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(z, y))] = \top$
 6. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D2:≈_u, D3:∃
 $\ \& \ \forall K(H \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1$
 $\ \rightarrow \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ J[\exists y(\mathbf{3}(y) \wedge \delta_y(C(y)) \wedge L(z, y))] = \top)$
 7. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D3:∧, n, B(
 $\ \& \ \forall K(H \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1$
 $\ \rightarrow \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3 \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ \langle J(z), J(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 8. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D2:≈_u, J(u)
 $\ \& \ \exists J(\{h[x/\llbracket a \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3 \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, J(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \exists J(\{h[x/\llbracket b \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ |J(y)| = 3 \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))] = \top \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, J(y) \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 9. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D2:≈_u, Fδ, D3:B(
 $\ \& \ \exists J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3(\{h[x/\llbracket a \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \exists J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3(\{h[x/\llbracket b \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall K(J \approx_z K \ \& \ K(z) \subseteq \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |K(z)| = 1 \rightarrow K(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 10. $\exists H: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H(x) = \{\llbracket a \rrbracket, \llbracket b \rrbracket\}$ D2:≈_u, G(u)
 $\ \& \ \exists J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3(\{h[x/\llbracket a \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket) \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \exists J \exists c_1, c_2, c_3(\{h[x/\llbracket b \rrbracket]: h \in H\} \approx_y J \ \& \ J(y) = \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \ \& \ |\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket) \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$

e.g. $J: x \quad y \quad \text{partial matrix, relevant variables \& assignments only}$

a	c ₁
a	c ₂
a	c ₃
b	c ₁ '
b	c ₂ '
b	c ₃ '

11. $\exists c_1, c_2, c_3(|\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3 \ \& \ \{\{c_1\}, \{c_2\}, \{c_3\}\} \subseteq \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket a \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$ simpl.
 $\ \& \ \exists c_1, c_2, c_3(|\{c_1, c_2, c_3\}| = 3 \ \& \ \{\{c_1\}, \{c_2\}, \{c_3\}\} \subseteq \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle \{\llbracket b \rrbracket\}, \{c_1, c_2, c_3\} \rangle \in \llbracket L \rrbracket)$

QUANTIFIERS IN PIL

1 QUANTIFIERS AS 2-PLACE PREDICATES

Extend PIL with:

DEFINITION 2 (PIL-models and assignments)

M. A PIL-model is a structure $M = \langle D, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket \rangle$ such that:

⋮

iii. for any $X, Y \in \mathcal{P}(D)$:

$$\langle X, Y \rangle \in \llbracket all \rrbracket \quad \text{iff} \quad X \subseteq Y$$

$$\langle X, Y \rangle \in \llbracket sm \rrbracket \quad \text{iff} \quad X \cap Y \neq \emptyset$$

$$\langle X, Y \rangle \in \llbracket most \rrbracket \quad \text{iff} \quad |X \cap Y| > |X \setminus Y|$$

$$\langle X, Y \rangle \in \llbracket n! \rrbracket \quad \text{iff} \quad |X \cap Y| = n$$

ABBREVIATIONS 2 (proper part, maximization, induced quantifiers)

- $(A \subset B) \quad := \quad ((A \subseteq B) \wedge \neg(A = B))$ for $A, B \in \mathbf{Trm}$
- $\mathbf{M}_u(\phi) \quad := \quad (\neg \exists v (u \subset v \wedge \phi[u/v]) \wedge \phi)$ $\phi \in \mathbf{For}$, no v in ϕ
- $\mathbf{Q}u(\phi, \psi) \quad := \quad \exists u \exists v (\mathbf{M}_v(\phi[u/v]) \wedge \mathbf{M}_u(u \subseteq v \wedge \psi) \wedge Q(v, u))$ $Q \in \{all, sm, most, n!\}$

FACTS

$$\mathbf{FC} \quad G \llbracket (A \subset B) \rrbracket \quad = \quad \top, \quad \text{iff} \quad G \llbracket A \rrbracket \subset G \llbracket B \rrbracket$$

$$\mathbf{FM} \quad G \llbracket \mathbf{M}_u(\phi) \rrbracket \quad = \quad \top, \quad \text{iff} \quad \neg(\exists H: G \approx_v H \ \& \ G(u) \subset H(v) \ \& \ H \llbracket \phi[u/v] \rrbracket = \top) \ \& \ G \llbracket \phi \rrbracket = \top$$

$$\mathbf{FQ} \quad G \llbracket \mathbf{Q}u(\phi, \psi) \rrbracket \quad = \quad \top, \quad \text{iff} \quad \exists H \exists K (G \approx_u H \ \& \ H \approx_v K \ \& \ K \llbracket \mathbf{M}_v(\phi[u/v]) \rrbracket \ \& \ K \llbracket \mathbf{M}_u(u \subseteq v \wedge \psi) \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(v), H(u) \rangle \in \llbracket Q \rrbracket)$$

Some paradigm examples:

- (1) All the women gathered in the square. ↓MON↑, collective VP
 (1') **all** $x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge all(x', x)$
- (2) Every child is asleep. ↓MON↑, distributive VP
 (2') **all** $x(\delta_x(C(x)), \delta_x(S(x)))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(C(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))) \wedge all(x', x)$
- (3) Most women gathered in the square. MON↑, collective VP
 (3') **most** $x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge most(x', x)$
- (4) None of the women gathered in the square. ↓MON↓, collective VP
 (4') $\neg \mathbf{sm} \ x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge sm(x', x)$
- (5) (Last year) two scientists (*jointly*) wrote an important paper. collective VP
 (5') **2!** $x(\delta_x(S(x)), \exists y(P(y) \wedge \mathbf{1}(y) \wedge W(x, y)))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(S(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \exists y(P(y) \wedge \mathbf{1}(y) \wedge W(x, y))) \wedge 2!(x', x)$
- (6) (Last year) two scientists (*each*) wrote an important paper. distributive VP
 (6') **2!** $x(\delta_x(S(x)), \delta_x(\exists y(P(y) \wedge \mathbf{1}(y) \wedge W(x, y))))$
 $:= \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(S(x')))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(\exists y(P(y) \wedge \mathbf{1}(y) \wedge W(x, y)))) \wedge 2!(x', x)$

2. SAMPLE TRUTH CONDITIONS AND MODELS

(1) All the women gathered in the square.

↓MON↑, collective VP

(1') $\models_M \mathbf{all} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$ iff $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x))$ iff $\exists X \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: $\forall d(d \in X \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket) \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$ $\& \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$ Sample models:Witness for $\exists X$ Truth values $M_0 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_0} \rangle$

none

predicted: $\neq_{M_0} (1')$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_0} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_0} (1')$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_0} = \{\{a, b, c, d\}\}$ **Oops!****Solution:** constrain $\llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^M$
for collective predicates $M_1 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_1} \rangle$ $X = \{a, b, c\}$ predicted: $\models_{M_1} (1')$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_1} (1)$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, b, c\} \ \& \ |X| \geq 2\}$

✓

 $M_2 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_2} \rangle$

none

predicted: $\neq_{M_2} (1')$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\neq_{M_2} (1)$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, b, d\} \ \& \ |X| \geq 2\}$

✓

 $M_3 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_3} \rangle$ $X = \{a, b, c\}$ predicted: $\models_{M_3} (1')$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_3} (1')$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, b, c, d\} \ \& \ |X| \geq 2\}$

✓

(2) Every child is asleep.

↓MON↑, distributive VP

(2') $\models_M \mathbf{all} x(\delta_x(C(x)), \delta_x(S(x)))$ iff $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(C(x))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x))$ iff $\exists X \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: $\forall d(d \in X \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ d \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$ $\& \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket))$ Sample models:Witness for $\exists X$ Truth values $M_1 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_1} \rangle$ $X = \{a, b, c\}$ predicted: $\models_{M_1} (2')$ $\llbracket C \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_1} (2)$ $\llbracket S \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$

✓

 $M_2 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_2} \rangle$

none

predicted: $\neq_{M_2} (2')$ $\llbracket C \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\neq_{M_2} (2')$ $\llbracket S \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{d\}\}$

✓

 $M_3 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_3} \rangle$ $X = \{a, b, c\}$ predicted: $\models_{M_3} (2')$ $\llbracket C \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_2} (2')$ $\llbracket S \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}, \{d\}\}$

✓

(3) Most (of the) women gathered in the square.

MON \uparrow , collective VP(3') $\models_M \mathbf{most} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$ iff $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{most}(x', x))$ iff $\exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$:
$$\begin{aligned} & \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket) \\ & \& X \subseteq X' \& X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \& |X' \cap X| > |X \setminus X| \\ & \& \neg \exists Y(X' \subset Y \subseteq D^M \& \forall d: d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket^M) \\ & \& \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \subseteq X' \& Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket^M) \end{aligned}$$
Sample models: $M_1 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_1} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, b, c\} \& |X| \geq 2\}$ Witnesses for X', X $X' := \{a, b, c\}$ $X := \{a, b, c\}$ Truth valuespredicted: $\models_{M_1} (3')$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_1} (3)$

✓

 $M_2 = \langle \{a, b, c, d\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_2} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, b, d\} \& |X| \geq 2\}$ $X' := \{a, b, c\}$ $X := \{a, b\}$ predicted: $\models_{M_2} (3')$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_2} (3)$

✓

 $M_3 = \langle \{a, b, c, d, e\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_3} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, d, e\} \& |X| \geq 2\}$ $X' := \{a, b, c\}$ none for X predicted: $\not\models_{M_3} (3')$ MB intuition: $\not\models_{M_3} (3)$

✓

(4) None of the women gathered in the square.

 \downarrow MON \downarrow , collective VP(4') $\models_M \neg \mathbf{sm} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$ iff $\models_M \neg \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{sm}(x', x))$ iff $\neg \exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$:
$$\forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket^M) \& \emptyset \subset X \subseteq X' \& X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket^M$$
Sample models: $M_1 = \langle \{a, b, c, d, e\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_1} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_1} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{d, e\}: |X| \geq 2\}$ Counterexamples for X', X $X' := \{a, b, c\}$ none for X Truth valuespredicted: $\models_{M_1} (4')$ MB intuition: $\models_{M_1} (4)$

✓

 $M_2 = \langle \{a, b, c, d, e\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_2} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_2} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, d, e\} \& |X| \geq 2\}$ $X' := \{a, b, c\}$ none for X predicted: $\models_{M_2} (4')$ MB intuition: $\not\models_{M_2} (4)$

remark: possibly a different reading of (4), with *gather* = *come to the gathering*

 $M_3 = \langle \{a, b, c, d, e\}, \llbracket \cdot \rrbracket^{M_3} \rangle$ $\llbracket W \rrbracket^{M_3} = \emptyset$ $\llbracket G \rrbracket^{M_3} = \{X \mid X \subseteq \{a, d, e\}: |X| \geq 2\}$ none for X' hence none for X predicted: $\models_{M_3} (4')$ MB intuition: $\neg(\models_{M_3} (4))$

problem: (4) presupposes a plural set of women

(4'') $\models_M \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \neg \exists x (\mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{sm}(x', x)))$ iff $\exists X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$:
$$\forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket^M) \& \neg \exists X(\emptyset \subset X \subseteq X' \& X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket^M)$$

3. DETAILED DERIVATIONS

- (1) All the women gathered in the square. ↓MON↑, collective VP
0. $\models_M \mathbf{all} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$
1. $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x))$ A2.Q
2. $\mathcal{G}^M \llbracket \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x)) \rrbracket = \top$ D4:|=
3. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FQ
 $\ \& \ K \llbracket \mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \rrbracket = \top \ \& \ K \llbracket \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \rrbracket = \top$
 $\ \& \ \langle K(x'), K(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{all} \rrbracket$
4. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FM, D2. $\llbracket \mathbf{all} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J \llbracket \delta_y(W(y)) \rrbracket = \top)$
 $\ \& \ K \llbracket \delta_x(W(x')) \rrbracket = \top$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J \llbracket y \subseteq x' \wedge G(y) \rrbracket = \top)$
 $\ \& \ K \llbracket x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x) \rrbracket = \top \ \& \ K(x') \subseteq K(x)$
5. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ D3. $\wedge, \subseteq, B, A, D2. \approx$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J \llbracket \delta_y(W(y)) \rrbracket = \top)$
 $\ \& \ K \llbracket \delta_x(W(x')) \rrbracket = \top$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ K(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ K(x') \subseteq K(x)$
6. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ rearr., simplify
 $\ \& \ K \llbracket \delta_x(W(x')) \rrbracket = \top$
 $\ \& \ K(x) = K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J \llbracket \delta_y(W(y)) \rrbracket = \top)$
7. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ F δ , D2. \approx_w , D3.B(
 $\ \& \ \forall I (K \approx_y I \ \& \ I(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ |I(y)| = 1 \rightarrow I(y) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ K(x) = K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall I' (J \approx_z I' \ \& \ I'(z) \subseteq J(y) \ \& \ |I'(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I'(y) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
8. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\forall I$
 $\ \& \ \forall d (d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ K(x) = K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J (K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall d (d \in J(y) \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
9. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\exists J$
 $\ \& \ \forall d (d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket) \ \& \ K(x) = K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y (K(x') \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d (d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
10. $\exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: elim. $\exists H, \exists K$
 $\ \forall d (d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket) \ \& \ X = X' \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y (X' \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d (d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
11. $\exists X \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: elim. $\exists X'$
 $\ \forall d (d \in X \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket) \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y (X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d (d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$

- (2) Every child is asleep. ↓ MON ↑, distributive VP
0. $\models_M \mathbf{all} x(\delta_x(C(x)), \delta_x(S(x)))$
1. $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(C(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x))$
2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(C(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))) \wedge \mathbf{all}(x', x))] = \top$ D4:|=
3. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FQ
 $\ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(C(x')))] = \top \ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x)))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ \langle K(x'), K(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{all} \rrbracket$
4. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FM, D2. $\llbracket \mathbf{all} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))]) = \top$
 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(C(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[y \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))]) = \top$
 $\ \& \ K[x \subseteq x' \wedge \delta_x(S(x))] = \top \ \& \ K(x') \subseteq K(x)$
5. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ D3. \wedge, \subseteq, B, A
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))]) = \top$
 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(C(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq J(x') \ \& \ K[\delta_x(S(x'))]) = \top$
 $\ \& \ K(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ K[\delta_x(S(x'))] = \top \ \& \ K(x') \subseteq K(x)$
6. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ rearrange, simplify
 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(C(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ K(x) = K(x') \ \& \ K[\delta_x(S(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(C(y))]) = \top$
7. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ F δ , D3.B, D2. \approx_u
 $\ \& \ \forall I(K \approx_y I \ \& \ I(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ |I(y)| = 1 \rightarrow I(y) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = K(x') \ \& \ \forall I(K \approx_y I \ \& \ I(y) \subseteq H(x) \ \& \ |I(y)| = 1 \rightarrow I(y) \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y))$
 $\ \ \ \ \ \& \ \forall I(J \approx_z I \ \& \ I(z) \subseteq J(y) \ \& \ |I(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I(z) \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
8. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\forall I$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) = K(x') \ \& \ \forall d(d \in H(x) \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall d(d \in J(y) \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket))$
9. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\exists J$, simplify
 $\ \& \ H(x) = K(x') \ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ \{d\} \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(K(x') \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket))$
10. $\exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: elim. $\exists H, \exists K$
 $\ X = X' \ \& \ \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ \{d\} \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X' \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket))$
11. $\exists X \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: elim. $\exists X'$
 $\ \forall d(d \in X \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket \ \& \ \{d\} \in \llbracket S \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket C \rrbracket))$

- (3) Most (of the) women gathered in the square. ↓MON↑, collective VP
0. $\models_M \mathbf{most} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$
1. $\models_M \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{most}(x', x))$ A2.Q
2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{most}(x', x))] = \top$ D4:|=
3. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FQ
 $\ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x')))] = \top \ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
4. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ FM, rearrange
 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(W(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ K[x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)] = \top \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(W(y))] = \top)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[y \subseteq x' \wedge G(y)] = \top)$
5. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ D3. $\wedge, \subseteq, B, A, D2. \approx$
 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(W(x'))] = \top$
 $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(W(y))] = \top)$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
6. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ F δ , D3.B, A
 $\ \& \ \forall I(K \approx_z I \ \& \ I(z) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ |I(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I(z) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall I(J \approx_z I \ \& \ I(z) \subseteq J(y) \ \& \ |I(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I(z) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
7. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\forall d$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall d(d \in J(y) \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
8. $\exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\exists J$, simplify
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(K(x') \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(H(x) \subset Y \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
9. $\exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: elim. $\exists H, K$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ X \subseteq X' \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle X', X \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \subseteq X' \ \& \ Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$
10. $\exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$: D2. $\llbracket \mathbf{most} \rrbracket$
 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$
 $\ \& \ X \subseteq X' \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ |X' \cap X| > |X \setminus X|$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$
 $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \subseteq X' \ \& \ Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$

(4) None of the women gathered in the square.

 \downarrow MON \uparrow , collective VP0. $\models_M \neg \mathbf{sm} x(\delta_x(W(x)), G(x))$ 1. $\models_M \neg \exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{sm}(x', x))$

A2.Q

2. $\mathcal{G}^M[\exists x \exists x' (\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x'))) \wedge \mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)) \wedge \mathbf{sm}(x', x))] \neq \top$ D4: \models , D3. \neg 3. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$

FQ

 $\ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(\delta_x(W(x')))] = \top \ \& \ K[\mathbf{M}_x(x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x))] = \top$ $\ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ 4. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$

FM, rearrange

 $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(W(x'))] = \top$ $\ \& \ K[x \subseteq x' \wedge G(x)] = \top \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(W(y))]) = \top$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[y \subseteq x' \wedge G(y)]) = \top$ 5. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ D3. \wedge , \subseteq , B , A , D2. \approx $\ \& \ K[\delta_x(W(x'))] = \top$ $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ J[\delta_y(W(y))]) = \top$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$ 6. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ F δ , D3.B(A) $\ \& \ \forall I(K \approx_z I \ \& \ I(z) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ |I(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I(z) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$ $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ K(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall I(J \approx_z I \ \& \ I(z) \subseteq J(y) \ \& \ |I(z)| = 1 \rightarrow I(z) \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$ 7. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\forall d$, simplify $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$ $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ K(x') \subset J(y) \ \& \ \forall d(d \in J(y) \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists J(K \approx_y J \ \& \ H(x) \subset J(y) \ \& \ J(y) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ J(y) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$ 8. $\neg \exists H, K: \mathcal{G}^M \approx_x H \ \& \ H \approx_{x'} K$ elim. $\exists J$ $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in K(x') \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$ $\ \& \ H(x) \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ H(x) \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ \langle K(x'), H(x) \rangle \in \llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(K(x') \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(H(x) \subset Y \subseteq K(x') \ \& \ Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$ 9. $\neg \exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$:elim. $\exists H, K$, D2. $\llbracket \mathbf{sm} \rrbracket$ $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$ $\ \& \ X \subseteq X' \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket \ \& \ X' \cap X \neq \emptyset$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \ \& \ \forall d(d \in Y \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket))$ $\ \& \ \neg \exists Y(X \subset Y \subseteq X' \ \& \ Y \in \llbracket G \rrbracket)$ 10. $\neg \exists X, X' \in \mathcal{P}(D^M) \setminus \{\emptyset\}$:

simplify

 $\ \& \ \forall d(d \in X' \rightarrow \{d\} \in \llbracket W \rrbracket)$ $\ \& \ \emptyset \subset X \subseteq X' \ \& \ X \in \llbracket G \rrbracket$